## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

CARPENTER TECHNOLOGY CORP., : CIVIL ACTION

Plaintiff

:

v. : NO. 08-2907

:

**ALLEGHENY TECHNOLOGIES**:

INC., et al.,

**Defendants** 

## ORDER

**AND NOW,** this 2nd day of August, 2011, upon careful consideration of the plaintiff's motion for summary judgment on the issue of obviousness (Document No. 80), the defendants' response thereto (Document No. 88), and the plaintiff's reply, IT IS HERE BY ORDERED that the motion is **DENIED.** 

BY THE COURT:

/s/ Lawrence F. Stengel
LAWRENCE F. STENGEL, J.